



**RUSSIA**  

---

**IN GLOBAL AFFAIRS**

Print ISSN 1810-6374  
Online ISSN 2618-9844

# Creative disruption



VOLUME 19

**No.1 (73)**

JANUARY–MARCH • 2021



# RUSSIA

---

## IN GLOBAL AFFAIRS

ISSN 1810-6374

VOLUME 19 • No. 1 • JANUARY – MARCH • 2021

Moscow 2021



## EDITORIAL OFFICE

Fyodor Lukyanov  
Natalya Kostromskaya  
Alexander Solovyov

*Editor-in-Chief*  
*Deputy Editor-in-Chief*  
*Deputy Editor-in-Chief*

Irina Palekhova  
*Executive Director*  
Alexander Zakharov  
*Copy Editor*  
Yevgeniya Prokopchuk  
*Production Editor*

Anna Portnova  
*Assistant to Editor-in-Chief*  
Yelena Blinnikova  
*Assistant to Chairman*  
*of the Editorial Board*  
Natalia Zablotskite  
*Computer Makeup*

Valeriya Chistyakova  
*promo@globalaffairs.ru*  
*Deputy Executive Director*  
*for Marketing*  
Yuri Kotov  
*op@globalaffairs.ru*  
*Deputy Executive Director*  
*for Development*

## BOARD OF ADVISORS

**Anatoly Adamishin**

Vice-Minister of Foreign Affairs of USSR (1986–1990), First Vice-Minister of Foreign Affairs of Russia (1993–1994), Minister of CIS Affairs for Russia (1997–1998). *Moscow, Russia*

**Olga Butorina**

Dr. Sc. (Economics), Professor. Head of Chair, European Integration Dpt., Advisor to the President, Moscow State University a Foreign Affairs. *Moscow, Russia*

**Alexander Filipov**

Dr. Sc. (Sociology), Professor, National Research University–Higher School of Economics; Head of the Center for Fundamental Social Science, Poletayev Institute for Historical and Theoretical Studies in the Humanities. *Moscow, Russia*

**Leonid Grigoriev**

Chief Advisor to the Head of the Analysis Center under the Government of the Russian Federation, Head of the World Economy Chair of the World Economy and International Affairs Department of the National Research University–Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*

**Sergey Kravets**

Executive Editor of *The Great Russian Encyclopedia* publishers, Chief of the Religious and Research Center Orthodox Encyclopedia. *Moscow, Russia*

**Alexey Kuznetsov**

Doctor of Science in Economy, Director, Institute of Scientific Information for Social Sciences of the Russian Academy of Sciences (INION RAN), Corresponding Member of the Russian Academy of Sciences. *Moscow, Russia*

**Andrey Lankov**

PhD (History), Prof., Kookmin University, College of Social Studies. *Seoul, Republic of Korea*

**Marlene Laruelle**

Professor of Political Science and International Affairs, Research Professor, Director, Institute for European, Russian and Eurasian Studies (IERES), George Washington University. *Washington, DC, USA*

**Peter Paul Anatol Lieven**

Professor, Georgetown University in Qatar, Senior Fellow of the New America Foundation in Washington DC. *United Kingdom*

**Alexander Lomanov**

Dr. Sc. (History). Chief Researcher at the Institute of Far Eastern Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences. *Moscow, Russia*

**Alexei Miller**

Dr. Sc. (History). Professor, European University at Saint-Petersburg. *St.-Petersburg, Russia*

**Mehdi Sanaei**

PhD (Political Science), Senior Advisor to the Foreign Minister of Iran, former Ambassador of Iran to Russia; Professor, Senior Lecturer, University of Tehran; Head of the Center for Iranian and Eurasian Studies. *Tehran, Iran*

**Yuri Slezkine**

Professor of History, Director of the Institute of Slavic, East European, and Eurasian Studies at the University of California, *Berkeley, USA*

**Andrei Tsygankov**

Professor, International Relations and Political Science San Francisco State University, *San Francisco, USA*

## BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Vladimir POTANIN  
(Chairman)  
*President,*  
*Interros Holding Company*

Igor ASHURBEILI  
*Chairman, Board*  
*of Directors "Socium-A"*

Ruslan YUNUSOV  
*Director General*  
*of Russian Quantum Center*

## FOUNDERS:

COUNCIL ON FOREIGN  
AND DEFENSE POLICY

NATIONAL  
RESEARCH UNIVERSITY  
HIGHER SCHOOL  
OF ECONOMICS

RUSSIAN INTERNATIONAL  
AFFAIRS COUNCIL

PUBLISHED BY  
FOREIGN POLICY RESEARCH  
FOUNDATION  
17 Malaya Ordynka Str.,  
Moscow 119017, Russia

Address:  
17 Malaya Ordynka Str.,  
Moscow 119017, Russia  
tel.: +7 (495) 980-7353  
fax: +7 (495) 937-7611  
e-mail: info@globalaffairs.ru  
globalaffairs.ru

Registered with  
THE MINISTRY  
OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION  
FOR PRESS, TV AND RADIO  
BROADCASTING AND MEANS  
OF MASS COMMUNICATION  
PI No. FS 77-52915  
20 February 2013

Printed by  
GART Printing House  
Order No. 185  
Circulation: 500 copies

The views of the authors do not necessarily coincide with the opinions of the Editors. The responsibility for the authenticity and accuracy of the facts in the published articles rests with the authors.

© Foreign Policy Research Foundation, 2021

All rights reserved. Reproduction in part or whole is allowed only with the explicit authorization of the publisher.

## EDITORIAL BOARD

- Sergei Karaganov** (Chairman) Dr. Sc. (History), Honorary Chairman, Presidium of the Council on Foreign and Defense Policy; Dean of the Faculty of World Economy and International Relations of the National Research University—Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*
- Martti Ahtisaari** President of Finland (1994–2000). *Finland*
- Graham Allison** Douglas Dillon Professor of Government, John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University. *Cambridge, Massachusetts, U.S.A.*
- Alexei Arbatov** Member of the Russian Academy of Sciences; Director, Center of International Security, Institute of the World Economy and International Relations, Russian Academy of Sciences. *Moscow, Russia*
- Alexander Avdeyev** (in a personal capacity) Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary. *Moscow, Russia*
- Lev Belousov** (Deputy Chairman) Dr. Sc. (History), Professor, Head of the Department of Modern and Contemporary History; Acting Dean of the History Faculty, Moscow State University. *Moscow, Russia*
- C. Fred Bergsten** PhD (Economics), Senior Fellow and Director Emeritus, Peterson Institute for International Economics; Assistant Secretary, Treasury Department (1977–1981). *Washington, D.C., U.S.A.*
- Carl Bildt** Prime Minister of Sweden (1991–1994), Minister of Foreign Affairs of Sweden (2006–2014); Co-Chair European Council on Foreign Relations. *Halmstad, Sweden*
- Vladimir Grigoryev** (in a personal capacity) Deputy Head of the Federal Agency on Press and Mass Communication of the Russian Federation. *Moscow, Russia*
- Igor Ivanov** Dr. Sc. (History), President, Russian Council on Foreign Relations, Prof., Moscow State Institute of International Relation. *Moscow, Russia*
- Karl Kaiser** Prof., Director, German Council on Foreign Relations (1973–2003); Senior Associate Emeritus, Harvard Kennedy School; Professor Emeritus at the University of Bonn. *Bonn, Germany*
- Irina Khakamada** Dr. Sc. (Economics), State Duma Deputy (1994–2003); Member of the Presidential Council for the Development of Civil Society and Human Rights (2012–2018); lecturer at MGIMO University; journalist. *Moscow, Russia*
- Ivan Krastev** Chairman of the Centre for Liberal Strategies in Sofia; Permanent Fellow at the Institute for Human Sciences in Vienna. *Bulgaria*
- Andrei Kokoshin** Member of the Russian Academy of Sciences; Director, Institute of International Security. *Moscow, Russia*
- Mikhail Komissar** Director General, Interfax News Agency. *Moscow, Russia*
- Konstantin Kosachev** PhD (Law), Chairman, International Affairs Committee of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation. *Moscow, Russia*
- Yaroslav Kuzminov** Dr. Sc. (Economics), Rector, National Research University—Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*
- Sergei Lavrov** (in a personal capacity) Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation. *Moscow, Russia*
- Vladimir Lukin** Dr. Sc. (History), Prof., Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of Russian Federation, Member of the Federation Council of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation; Research Professor at NRU Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*
- Fyodor Lukyanov** Chairman of Presidium of the Council on Foreign and Defense Policy; Editor-in-Chief, *Russia in Global Affairs*, Research Professor at NRU Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*
- Vladimir Mau** Dr. Sc. (Economics), Professor, Director of the Russian Academy of the National Economy and Public Administration under the President of the Russian Federation. *Moscow, Russia*
- Thierry de Montbrial** Director, French Institute of International Relations; Member, Academie des Sciences Morales et Politiques, Institut de France; Founder and Chairman of the World Policy Conference (WPC). *France*
- Vyacheslav Nikonov** (Deputy Chairman) Dr. Sc. (History), Prof., Chairman, Polity Foundation; Chairman, Rusky Mir Foundation; Chairman, State Duma Committee on Education; Dean, School of Public Administration at Moscow State University. *Moscow, Russia*
- Yevgeny Primakov** (in a personal capacity) Head of the Federal Agency for the Commonwealth of Independent States, Compatriots Living Abroad and International Cultural Cooperation (Rossotrudnichestvo)
- Gideon Rose** Editor-in-Chief of *Foreign Affairs*; Member of the Council on Foreign Relations. *U.S.A.*
- Kevin Michael Rudd** President of the Asia Society Policy Institute; Prime Minister of Australia (2007–2010, 2013). *Australia*
- Vladimir Ryzhkov** Dr. Sc. (History), prof., NRU Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*
- Leonid Slutsky** Chairman of the State Duma Committee on International Affairs of the RF Federal Assembly. *Moscow, Russia*
- Horst Teltschik** Head of Foreign Policy Office of the Chancellor of Germany (1982–1998); Head of the Munich Security Conference (1999–2008). *Rottach-Egern, Germany*
- Anatoly Torkunov** Member of the Russian Academy of Sciences; Prof., Director, Moscow State Institute of International Relations; Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary. *Moscow, Russia*
- Yuri Ushakov** (in a personal capacity) Aide to the Russian President. *Moscow, Russia*
- Lord William Wallace** Prof., London School of Economics; Council Member of the Royal Institute of International Affairs (1978–1990). *London, U.K.*
- Xiong Guangkai** General (ret.), Adjunct Professor at Qinghua University and Beijing University. *China*
- Igor Yurgens** PhD (Economics), Chairman of the Board of the Institute of Contemporary Development; Member of the Board of the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs; President of the All-Russia Insurance Association. *Moscow, Russia*
- Sergei Zverev** President, KROS Public Relations Company; Member of the Academic Council, NRU Higher School of Economics. *Moscow, Russia*

# Contents

*Fyodor A. Lukyanov* The Time to Be by Yourself 5

## THE SUN SETS IN THE WEST

*Timofei V. Bordachev*  
The Charter of Paris and a New European Order 12

*Sergei A. Karaganov*  
A Cleansing Crisis? 32

*Andrei A. Sushentsov*  
The “Difficult Age” of Eastern Europe and the Case of Belarus 44

## EX ORIENTE LUX?

*Nikolay V. Litvak, Natalia B. Pomozova*  
Chinese Diplomatic Discourse for Europe: A Change of Style 50

*Konstantin V. Asmolov, Vasilii V. Lebedev*  
North Korea’s Ideology and Propaganda: Signs of Change 70

*Ellina P. Shavlay*  
India’s and Russia’s Approaches to the Indo-Pacific—Marrying the Two 98

## RUSSIA: STRUGGLING OUT

*Vera D. Ageeva*  
The Rise and Fall of Russia’s Soft Power 118

*Andrei P. Tsygankov, Pavel A. Tsygankov, Haley Gonzales*  
Putin’s “Global Hybrid War”: U.S. Experts, Russia,  
and the Atlantic Council 146

## WHAT TOMORROW HOLDS

*Jozef Hrabina*  
The Year of Crises: How 2020 Will Reshape the Structure  
of International Relations 174

*Anatol Lieven*  
Climate Change and State Interest 200